# MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION OF ARIZONA

Held at 800 West Washington Street Conference Room 308 Phoenix, Arizona 85007 Thursday, February 8, 2018 – 1:00 p.m.

Present:

Dale L. Schultz

Chairman

Joseph M. Hennelly, Jr.

Vice Chair

Scott P. LeMarr

Commissioner

Robin S. Orchard

Commissioner

James Ashley

Director

Jason M. Porter

Chief Legal Counsel

Trevor Laky

Legislative Affairs Chief / Public Information Officer

Sylvia Simpson

Chief Financial Officer

Renee Pastor

Self Insurance

Gregg Morgan

Assistant Claims Manager

Adella Sermeno

Claims Specialist

William Warren

ADOSH Director

Phil Murphy

Assistant ADOSH Director

Wendi McMillan

Compliance Officer

Afshan Peimani

Legal Division Staff Attorney

Kara Dimas

Commission Secretary

Vice Chair Hennelly convened the meeting at 1:02 p.m. Also in attendance were Paul Timmons with New Wincup Holdings, Inc.; Nolan deGraaff and Omar Bahena with Ice Now, Inc.; Deb Baker with Valley Schools Workers' Compensation Pool; Christopher Hansen with the City of Tempe; Lauren Boutom with R Street Institute; and Jordan Chavez with Snell & Wilmer. Chairman Schultz was not present at the commencement of the meeting.

Approval of Minutes of February 1, 2018 Regular Meeting Minutes.

Vice Chair Hennelly stated that the agenda item would be revisited later in the meeting.

#### Consent Agenda:

All items following under this agenda item are consent matters and will be considered by a single motion with no discussion unless a Commissioner asks to remove an item on the consent agenda to be discussed and voted on separately. The Commission may move into Executive Session under A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(2) to discuss records exempt by law from public inspection. Legal action involving a final vote or decision shall not be taken in Executive Session. If such action is required, then it will be taken in General Session.

- a. Approval of Proposed Civil Penalties Against Uninsured Employers.
  - 1. 2C17/18-0448

Maven Transport LLC

- 2. 2C17/18-0333
- Webb Hearing Centers
- b. <u>Approval of Requests for Renewal of Self-Insurance Authority.</u>

- 1. The Valley Schools Workers' Compensation Pool
- 2. City of Tempe

Vice Chair Hennelly removed item (b)(1) (The Valley Schools Workers' Compensation Pool) from the consent agenda to be heard later in the meeting.

Commissioner Orchard moved to approve the remaining items on the Consent Agenda and Commissioner LeMarr seconded the motion. Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Discussion and Action regarding Appointment of Special Assistant to the Industrial Commission of Arizona.

Mr. Morgan discussed Ms. Sermeno's employment history and recommended that she be appointed as Special Assistant to the Commission.

Commissioner LeMarr moved to appoint Ms. Sermeno as Special Assistant to the Industrial Commission of Arizona and Commissioner Orchard seconded the motion. Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor or the motion. The motion passed.

Discussion and Action of Arizona Division of Occupational Safety and Health Proposed Citations and Penalties.

Vice Chair Hennelly discussed the purpose of and process for the Commission's consideration of ADOSH citations and proposed penalties.

Ice Now, LLC

2440 W Lincoln St, Ste 140.

Phoenix, AZ 85009

Site Location:

2440 W Lincoln St, Ste 140

Phoenix, AZ 85009

Inspection No:

A3807-1271489

Inspection Date:

10/20/2017

<u>SERIOUS</u> – Citation 1 - Item 1 - a) Production: One operator was not provided a method of machine guarding that would protect the operator in the machine area from hazards created by the point of operation and rotating parts of the ice making machinery and auger conveying system. 29 CFR 1910.212(a)(1)

Div. Proposal - \$5,000.00

Formula Amt. - \$750.00

NON-SERIOUS - Citation 2- Item 1 - a) 2440 W Lincoln St, Ste 140 Phoenix, AZ 85009: The employer reported on October 19, 2017 the in-patient hospitalization of one employee who was injured on October 10, 2017 approximately 9 days after the date of the injury and not within twenty-four (24) hours as required. 29 CFR 1904.39(a)(2)

Div. Proposal - \$300.00

Formula Amt. - \$300.00

TOTAL PENALTY -\$5,300.00 TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - \$1,050.00

Referral

Years in Business:

Empl. Covered by inspection:

17

Mr. Murphy summarized the citations and proposed penalties and reviewed the photographs.

Commissioner Orchard and Mr. Murphy discussed appropriate machine guarding and the employer's abatement efforts.

Chairman Schultz joined the meeting.

Mr. deGraaff discussed the subject injury, machine guarding, equipment access, and the employer's current lockout/tagout program. He referred to photographs, discussed the circumstances leading to the injury, and discussed abatement.

Commissioner Orchard and Mr. deGraaff discussed the injured employee's current status.

Mr. deGraaff discussed the reporting delay and attributed the delay to his lack of awareness of the reporting requirements.

Vice Chair Hennelly and Mr. deGraaff discussed employee training as it related to abatement.

Commissioner Orchard and Mr. Murphy discussed the scope of the inspection, the employer's safety and training program, and the adequacy of the employer's lockout/tagout program.

Commissioner LeMarr moved to approve the citations and proposed penalties as presented and Commissioner Orchard seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

New Wincup Holdings, Inc.

7980 W Buckeye Rd

Phoenix, AZ 85043

Site Location:

Inspection No:

Inspection Date:

7980 W Buckeye Rd

Phoenix, AZ 85043

W0250-1274335 11/02/2017

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 1 - a) Shop: One employee who operated a WinCup MK Cup Machine-Serial Number 20184 was not trained in the energy control procedures. 29 CFR 1910.147(c)(7)(i)(B) Div. Proposal - \$5,000.00 Formula Amt. - \$2,250.00

SERIOUS – Citation 1 - Item 2 – a) Shop: One employee who operated a WinCup MK Cup Machine-Serial Number 20184 was not guarded to protect the operator from placing any part of his body into the danger zone during operation. 29 CFR 1910.212(a)(1)

Div. Proposal - \$2,250.00

Formula Amt. - \$2,250.00

TOTAL PENALTY - \$7,250.00

TOTAL FORMULA AMT. - \$4,500.00

Referral

Years in Business:

Empl. Covered by inspection:

60

19

Mr. Murphy summarized the citation and proposed penalties and reviewed the photographs.

Commissioner LeMarr, Mr. Murphy, and Ms. McMillan discussed the use of a red bar to clean the equipment and whether the bar was part of the manufacturer's design.

Mr. Timmons stated that the employer was operating under the routine servicing exemption and that the red bar was a protective measure. He discussed operating the subject machine and the circumstances leading to the injury.

Commissioner LeMarr, Commissioner Orchard, Mr. Warren, Mr. Murphy, and Mr. Timmons discussed whether the operation of the machine fell under the routine servicing exemption.

Commissioner Orchard and Mr. Timmons discussed the employer's safety and training program.

Vice Chair Hennelly and Mr. Timmons discussed the training issue referenced in Citation 1, Item 1 and whether the employer now provides necessary training.

Commissioner Orchard and Mr. Timmons discussed the employee's injuries, employment status, and current condition.

Commissioner Orchard and Ms. McMillan discussed the employer's abatement efforts.

Commissioner Orchard and Mr. Timmons discussed improved machine guarding and the employer's lockout/tagout process.

Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner Orchard, Mr. Warren, Ms. McMillan, and Mr. Timmons discussed ADOSH consultation services.

Commissioner LeMarr discussed his impression that there is a high injury rate among temporary employees.

Citing the employer's organized facility, its strong commitment to employee safety, and its abatement efforts, Commissioner LeMarr moved to reduce the proposed penalties (by 15%), as follows: (1) the proposed penalty for Citation 1, Item 1 be reduced from \$5,000.00 to \$4,250.00; and (2) the proposed penalty for Citation 1, Item 2 be reduced from \$2,250.00 to \$1,912.50, for a total penalty of \$6,162.50. Commissioner Orchard seconded the motion and noted her concerns about the injury. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

## Approval of Minutes of February 1, 2018 Regular Meeting Minutes.

Commissioner LeMarr moved to approve the Minutes of the February 1, 2018 regular session meeting and Chairman Schultz seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. Vice Chair Hennelly abstained. The motion passed.

## Approval of Requests for Renewal of Self-Insurance Authority.

<u>The Valley Schools Workers' Compensation Pool</u> - Vice Chair Hennelly discussed the Pool's progress in the reduction of its experience modification rating.

Commissioner Orchard recused herself from the agenda item.

Vice Chair Hennelly encouraged the Pool to work with the ADOSH Consultation Division on safety issues and commented on the improvement in the Pool's experience modification rating.

Chairman Schultz moved to approve the request for Renewal of Self-Insurance authority for The Valley Schools Worker's Compensation Pool and Commissioner LeMarr seconded the motion.

Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, and Commissioner LeMarr voted in favor of the motion. Commissioner Orchard did not vote. The motion passed.

Discussion and/or Action regarding delegation of authority to appoint an Interim Director of the Division of Occupational Safety and Health.

Mr. Ashley discussed the delegation of authority to appoint an Interim Director of the Division of Occupational Safety and Health.

Chairman Schultz and Mr. Ashley discussed the timeline for making the appointment.

Commissioner LeMarr moved to delegate authority to the Director of the Commission to appoint an Interim Director for ADOSH. Commissioner Orchard seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion. The motion passed.

Discussion and/or action regarding Industrial Commission goals, objectives and key initiatives for 2018. This Agenda Item may include discussion regarding the Commission budget and review of Division, Department, and Section specific objectives.

Mr. Ashley discussed his meeting with the Thai Consul General to discuss the Commission and its functions. He noted that the Thai Consulate General will be working with the Arizona Commerce Authority regarding operating a facility in Mesa.

Mr. Ashley provided an update on House Bill 2047, noting that it is now before the Senate.

Mr. Ashley discussed the possibility of a Federal government shutdown and an intent to maintain Commission operations as normal in the event of a shutdown.

Mr. Ashley discussed the Industrial Commission Employee Association's penny wars fundraiser and a food drive for St. Mary's Food Bank.

### Announcements, Scheduling of Future Meetings and Retirement Resolutions.

Ms. Dimas presented a retirement resolution for Jesus Cabrera, a Workers' Compensation Insurance Claims Program Supervisor in the Claims Division, who provided 31 years of state service.

Ms. Dimas confirmed Commission meeting dates through April 2018.

Mr. Ashley noted that the ICA Day on the Lawn at the Capitol will take place on April 12, 2018.

#### Public Comment.

Mr. Warren discussed his retirement from State service. He personally thanked the Commissioners, Director Ashley, and Mr. Porter for the opportunity (which he said was "the top" in his career); discussed the positive impact of the Arizona Management System on the Commission and ADOSH; and noted his support of the Commission and ADOSH's mission.

Vice Chair Hennelly thanked Mr. Warren for his professionalism and hard work.

Ms. Pastor discussed the City of Tempe's self-insurance application, its experience modification rating, and the City's participation in the ADOSH consultation program.

There was no other public comment.

Chairman Schultz moved to adjourn and Commissioner Orchard seconded the motion. Chairman Schultz, Vice Chair Hennelly, Commissioner LeMarr, and Commissioner Orchard voted in favor of the motion and the meeting was adjourned at 1:52 p.m.

THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION OF ARIZONA

By

James Ashley, Director

ATTEST

Kara Dimas, Commission Secretary